



ETINED

Time for change

*Ethics
Transparency
Integrity*

**ETINED
Council of Europe
Platform on Ethics,
Transparency and
Integrity in Education**



Volume 1
7th Session of
the Prague Forum

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

ETINED
Council of Europe
Platform on Ethics,
Transparency and
Integrity in Education

Volume 1 – 7th Session
of the Prague Forum

*The opinions expressed in this work are the
responsibility of the authors and do not
necessarily reflect the official policy of the
Council of Europe.*

All rights reserved. No part of this
publication may be translated,
reproduced or transmitted, in any form
or by any means, electronic
(CD-Rom, Internet, etc.) or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording or any
information storage or retrieval system,
without prior permission in writing from
the Directorate of Communication (F-67075
Strasbourg Cedex or publishing@coe.int).

Cover design: Documents and Publications
Production Department (SPDP),
Council of Europe

Layout: Jouve, Paris
Council of Europe Publishing
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex
<http://book.coe.int>

ISBN 978-92-871-8308-8
© Council of Europe, November 2016
Printed at the Council of Europe

Contents

INTRODUCTION	5
PROGRAMME OF THE 7TH SESSION OF THE PRAGUE FORUM	9
PART I: PRESENTATIONS MADE AT THE PRAGUE FORUM	13
LAUNCH OF THE PLATFORM	15
“SETTING THE FRAMEWORK: THE WORK OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE IN THE FIELD”: AN INTRODUCTION TO THE WORK ON ETHICS, TRANSPARENCY AND INTEGRITY IN EDUCATION DONE BY THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE	23
WORKING GROUP A: ETHICAL BEHAVIOUR OF ALL ACTORS IN EDUCATION	35
WORKING GROUP B: ACADEMIC INTEGRITY/PLAGIARISM	55
WORKING GROUP C: RECOGNITION OF QUALIFICATIONS	77
PRESENTATION OF THE GENERAL REPORT OF THE FORUM	91
“INSPIRATION FOR THE FUTURE – THE ESSENTIALS OF EDUCATING THE COMMUNITY”	103
BIOGRAPHICAL NOTES	117
PART II: CONTRIBUTIONS FROM MEMBER STATES	121
ALBANIA	123
AZERBAIJAN	127
BELGIUM (FLEMISH COMMUNITY)	129
BULGARIA	131
CYPRUS	135
FRANCE	137
Teaching and education professions: reference framework of professional competences and the ethical dimension	141
Situation regarding the recent measures for combating fraud in the education sector, examination fraud in particular	145
National Ethical Charter for the research professions	149
HUNGARY	153
ITALY	157
Transparency in the evaluation of learning outcomes and relationships	161
LITHUANIA	167
Reform of academia recognition of foreign qualifications system in Lithuania	169
LUXEMBOURG	173

ROMANIA	179
RUSSIA	183
SLOVENIA	187
UKRAINE	189

Introduction

One of the new flagship projects of the Directorate of Education of the Council of Europe is dedicated to its Pan-European Platform on Ethics, Transparency and Integrity in Education (ETINED).

The Council of Europe has worked for decades to promote quality education, which it has clearly defined in Recommendation CM/Rec(2012)13 to its member states on ensuring quality education. This specifies that a quality education must be free of corruption.

Corruption can affect all levels of education, in all European countries: from the embezzlement of funds intended for school buildings in pre-primary education to plagiarism in university essays and the selling of diplomas. Individuals might suffer sexual exploitation in the classroom; children from certain communities might be favoured for school admission while others are subject to extra payments; at institutional level there may be opaque and inaccessible recruitment procedures or nepotism; and, at the highest level, national budgets may be distributed unfairly, favouring certain higher education institutions. Corruption is evident in the most well-publicised incidents, like the high-profile resignation of ministers following revelations that their diplomas are fake or that they are guilty of plagiarism, to the most hidden – such as only teaching compulsory topics during private, fee-paying tutorials.

The examples of corruption are numerous and they can affect any child in Europe at different points of their schooling. A recent survey showed the percentage of the perception of corruption in education by citizens:¹ although numbers ranged from 6-7% to 70-72%, no country was seen as exempt from corruption.

The long-term consequences are disastrous: corruption disrupts citizens' trust in the school system and in democratic institutions more generally, resulting in a lack of participation in the democratic process. Corruption can also result in a diminution of a given country's reputation at international level.

1. *Global corruption barometer 2013*, Transparency International, available at www.transparency.org/gcb2013/report, accessed 5 September 2016.

The Council of Europe has developed comprehensive standards, legal instruments, norms and recommendations to fight corruption through criminal, civil and administrative law, all of which are monitored by the Group of States against Corruption (GRECO).² Its Parliamentary Assembly has also recently set up an alliance of parliamentarians called the PACE anti-corruption platform.³ ETINED will now focus on the level where everything begins: education.

In April 2013, the ministers of education of the 50 States Parties to the European Cultural Convention (ETS 18)⁴ agreed through the Helsinki Final Declaration to work together on ethics, transparency and integrity in education, for the mutual benefit of all European children, and to set up a platform to do so.⁵

ETINED is a network of specialists appointed by member states of the Council of Europe and of States Parties to the European Cultural Convention. Its mission is threefold:

- ▶ to share information and best practices in the field of transparency and integrity in education;
- ▶ to contribute to the development of adequate answers to challenges that corruption poses to the sector of education and higher education (HE);
- ▶ to create a virtuous cycle in education, whereby all actors commit to fundamental positive ethical principles.

ETINED wants to propose a new approach based on the idea that quality education will only be achieved, and corruption effectively addressed, if all relevant sectors of society commit fully to fundamental, positive ethical principles for public and professional life, rather than relying only upon top-down, mechanistic regulatory measures. It wants to help develop a culture of democracy and participation, based on the principles of ethics, transparency and integrity. Corruption should be fought through legal norms and structures, but this is not enough. It must also be considered unacceptable by stakeholders and the public at large.

ETINED will, as a first step, focus on three main themes of work:

- ▶ the ethical behaviour of everyone involved in education and codes of conduct for teachers and education professionals;
- ▶ academic integrity and plagiarism in the HE sector;
- ▶ the problem of diploma mills in the context of the recognition of qualifications.

The following activities are planned:

- ▶ an international seminar on plagiarism;
- ▶ a study comparing policies favouring academic integrity in HE across the 50 States Parties to the European Cultural Convention;
- ▶ regional roundtables on the impact of national codes of conduct for the

2. Available at www.coe.int/greco, accessed 5 September 2016.

3. Available at website-pace.net/web/apce/anti-corruption-platform, accessed 5 September 2016.

4. All 47 member states of the Council of Europe, plus Belarus, the Holy See and Kazakhstan.

5. Final Declaration of the 24th Session of the Council of Europe Standing Conference of Ministers of Education, Helsinki, 26 and 27 April 2013, available at www.coe.int/en/web/education-minister-conference/previous-conferences, accessed 5 September 2016.

teaching profession, with a view to establishing common guidelines based on good practices;

- ▶ pilot projects in member states.

The platform was launched by the Minister of Education, Youth and Sports of the Czech Republic, Ms Kateřina Valachová and the Director General of Democracy of the Council of Europe, Ms Snežana Samardžić-Marković on the occasion of the 7th Session of the Prague Forum on 1 and 2 October 2015.

The present publication is a compilation of the speeches and presentations that were made at the launch of ETINED in Prague. States Parties to the European Cultural Convention were also invited to submit written contributions on the theme and sub-themes of the Prague Forum, with concrete proposals and implications for future action at European level on the same. These contributions included:

- ▶ executive summaries about reforms being carried out by states or having a direct link with the theme of the forum, detailing the main challenges and the responses made;
- ▶ case studies or examples of good practice of evaluation of results obtained following reforms made or pilot projects conducted by states in relation to the sub-themes of the forum.

The contributions from member states are reproduced in Part II of the present document.



Programme of the 7th Session of the Prague Forum

Thursday 1 October 2015

9-9:30 Opening session – Launch of the platform

Chaired by Ladislav Bánovec, Director of the Department of International Relations, Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports of the Czech Republic

Welcome speeches:

Kateřina Valachová, Minister of Education, Youth and Sports, Czech Republic

Radka Wildová, Dean of the Faculty of Education, Charles University, Czech Republic

Tomáš Zima, Rector of Charles University, Czech Republic

Snežana Samardžić-Marković, Director General, DGII – Democracy, Council of Europe

9:30-10:30 Plenary session 1

“Setting the framework: the work of the Council of Europe in the field”

Chaired by Jindřich Fryč, Chair, Steering Committee for Educational Policy and Practice (CDPPE), Council of Europe

- Presentation of the work done by the Group of States against Corruption (GRECO) by Christian Manquet, Vice-President of GRECO
- “An introduction to the work on ethics, transparency and integrity in education done by the Council of Europe”: presentations by Ian Smith (University of the West of Scotland) and Tom Hamilton (General Teaching Council for Scotland), United Kingdom

10:50-12:15 Plenary session 2

“Cross views on perspectives and practices”

Chaired by Marie-Anne Persoons, Representative of the CDPPE

Speakers:

- Haldis Holst, Deputy Secretary General, Education International
- Boris Divjak, U4 Anti-Corruption Resource Centre Norway
- Muriel Poisson, International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP-UNESCO)
- Elena Panfilova, Transparency International

Questions and answers

14-15:30 Parallel working group sessions: case studies

A. Ethical behaviour of all actors in education

Chaired by Sabine Rohmann, Education and Culture Committee of the INGO Conference of the Council of Europe, Member of the Bureau of the CDPPE

Case studies:

- A national case study of how ethical behaviour has been approached in professional codes and standards, Tom Hamilton, General Teaching Council for Scotland, United Kingdom
- Advocating for honesty and transparency, Daiva Penkauskiene, Modern Didactics Centre, Lithuania
- Ethical principles, Ian Smith, University of the West of Scotland, United Kingdom

B. Academic integrity/plagiarism

Chaired by Maija Innola, Ministry of Education and Culture of Finland, Representative of the CDPPE

Case studies:

- Promoting maturity in policies for plagiarism across Europe and beyond, Irene Glendinning, Coventry University, United Kingdom
- Plagiarism in German medical dissertations, Debora Weber-Wulff, University of Applied Sciences, Germany

C. Recognition of qualifications

Chaired by Stefan Delplace, EURASHE, Member of the Bureau of the CDPPE

Case studies:

- The Decision of the Benelux Committee of Ministers on mutual automatic generic recognition of the level of higher education degrees M(2015)3 of 18 May 2015, Marie-Anne Persoons, Belgium
- The experience of the Swedish ENIC-NARIC office in dealing with fraudulent credentials and diploma mills, Erik Johansson, Department of Qualifications Recognition, ENIC-NARIC Sweden

16-17:00 Group sessions continued

17:00 Meeting of the general rapporteur with working groups rapporteurs

20:00 Award of the Pro Merito Medal of the Council of Europe in memory of Germain Dondelinger

Friday 2 October 2015

09:30-11 Roundtable – Input to the future work of the platform: answers from the parallel working group sessions

Chaired by Etienne Gilliard, Vice-Chair, CDPPE

Input from:

- Michèle Eisenbarth, Permanent Representative of Luxembourg to the Council of Europe, Chair of the GR-C
- Lea Meister, European Students' Union
- Quentin Reed, Education consultant
- Giorgi Sharvashidze, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Education and Science, Georgia
- Jens Vraa-Jensen, Education International

11:20-12:30 Plenary session 3

Presentation of the general report of the forum by Tomáš Foltýnek, Mendel University Brno, Czech Republic, General Rapporteur

“Inspiration for the future” – The essentials of educating the community. Keynote speech by Bertrand de Speville, Consultant, former head of the Independent Commission against Corruption (ICAC) of Hong Kong, United Kingdom

Presentation of the main challenges and expectations of the priorities of work, Jindřich Fryč, Chair, CDPPE

Closing remarks

Lukáš Teplý, Department of Strategy and European Affairs, Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport of the Czech Republic

Part I

**Presentations made
at the Prague Forum**

Opening session

Launch of the platform

**Kateřina Valachov, Minister of Education,
Youth and Sports, Czech Republic**

Dear Ms Samardžić-Markovi,

Dear Mr Zima,

Dear Ms Wildov,

Honourable guests,

Dear participants,

Let me first of all thank the organisers of the 7th Prague Forum for inviting me to open this event. I am very glad that this forum takes place here in Prague, on the premises of one of the oldest universities in the world, Charles University.

The 7th Prague Forum is a result of the long-term work of the Council of Europe in the field of promotion of quality education. The role of education is crucial for the future of our societies. The public system of education is practically the only one that accompanies people from their early childhood until their adulthood on a daily basis. As such, education is the most powerful tool for the better future of people. Good and accessible education provides social, cultural and economic emancipation for all. Education is also fundamental for a functional relationship among generations, for cultural understanding and tolerance as well as for the development of democratic citizenship. All these are values that we need to foster, especially in the current difficult situation in Europe.

The Ministry of Education and the Czech Government are aware of the key role of education for a democratic and socially just society. Quality and accessibility of education for all is our political priority. Therefore, we have prepared a system of support for children with special educational needs and changes in the financing of the educational system that will provide accessible education as well as leisure activities for children and youth. Of course, the system of higher education is of high importance as well – not only as the source of a qualified workforce, but mainly as a system producing well-educated people and citizens.

The main theme of this forum – “ethics, transparency and integrity in education” – is a topical and important issue. It is clear that in a quality system of education providing equal opportunities for all there is no place for unjustified benefits and other types of corruption, and, of course, any other forms of discriminatory or even harmful behaviour on the part of actors at all levels of the educational system.

Ladies and gentlemen,

I am looking forward to your fruitful discussion and to various opinions on this topic and wish your conference success.

Thank you.

Radka Wildová, Dean of the Faculty of Education

Madam Minister,

Your Excellency, Mr Rector,

Madam Director General,

Ladies and gentlemen, dear guests,

It is my great honour to welcome you, participants of the 7th Prague Forum on educational policies in Europe organised by the Council of Europe in co-operation with the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, Charles University in Prague and the Faculty of Education, on the theme "Towards a pan-European platform on ethics, transparency and integrity in education".

Introducing the Faculty of Education

The Faculty of Education, as one of the largest faculties of Charles University in Prague, fulfils its mission in the field of higher education and lifelong learning for teachers, educators and other educational staff, including the staff of the School of Management. We prepare teachers training to specialise in all curricular subjects in elementary and secondary schools. Research is mainly focused on the science of education and training, especially on didactics. Next year, along with other faculties of education in the Czech Republic and in Slovakia, the Faculty of Education at Charles University will celebrate 70 years as a university faculty.

The faculty is professionally oriented and works across the whole spectrum of education, from pre-school education to adult learning. Although Charles University in Prague has five other faculties involved in the preparation of teachers, the Faculty of Education is the only one dedicated to teacher preparation.

Currently, the Faculty of Education has more than 4 800 students studying full-time and part-time (66% in full-time study). In addition to the bachelor's and master's courses, the Faculty of Education also offers doctoral courses, which sees a future for the development of disciplines and subject didactics, which has long been in its research activities and international co-operation.

The Faculty of Education's international co-operation

Faculty members are actively involved in international co-operation with universities and institutions in Europe and beyond. There are 61 international intercollegiate agreements for collaboration, with the most focus on extensive co-operation with Germany and Poland. A contract with Joetsu University in Japan was recently concluded and will come into operation in January 2016 during the preparation of a travelling exhibition involving four universities from Taiwan, Mongolia, Japan and

the Czech Republic. Very close ties have traditionally been developed with Slovakian universities, in terms of educational mobility, the organisation of joint international conferences and the creation of specialist publications.

For the development of international relations in the field of science and research with French institutions it is of considerable importance to Charles University that we are a member of CEFRES (Centre français de recherche en sciences sociales).

Charles University has long supported student and staff mobility and work placements under Erasmus+, in which all departments are involved. Most contracts under Erasmus+ have been agreed with universities in Germany, France and Spain and the Slovak Republic.

The faculty is one of the first faculties of Charles University and in the Czech Republic actualises the Erasmus Mundus programme. Together with the University of Roehampton (the co-ordinating institution) and the University of Oslo, we plan to provide an MA in Special and Inclusive Education for students and academics.

There is, thus, relatively broad experience in international projects, shown in the past in dealing with projects under Frameworks 5, 6 and 7 and more than six Tempus projects. In 2014, faculty members were involved in 15 international European Union (EU) projects, one of which is a project belonging to the 7th Framework Programme. Application for the project ERASMUS-KA3 is currently being completed. In 2015, the faculty submitted three requests for the Horizon 2020 project.

Today's meeting

As Dean of the Faculty of Education, I fully support and welcome the initiative of the Council of Europe and its efforts to launch a pan-European platform on ethics, transparency and integrity. I am pleased that it is Charles University that is hosting participants for such an important forum, and which can create an appropriate environment for discussing such a serious and, at the same time, very current topic.

The Faculty of Education, the Czech Republic and Slovakia closely co-operate through the Association of Deans of Faculties of Education. The main topics of the 7th Prague Forum and its results will be used in the working meetings of the Association of Deans. The results of the forum will be followed very closely and we will try to reflect them in practice in the faculties' teaching.

One of the key priorities of the faculty is to ensure the quality of teaching and research activities. Thus:

- ▶ the faculty pays great attention to plagiarism in the academic work of its students and the publication activities of its research and teaching staff;
- ▶ the faculty strives for transparency in recruitment, systematically and through a multi-tier system and monitors compliance with all laws and regulations regarding admission procedures;
- ▶ the faculty has established long-term monitoring mechanisms for compliance with all regulations and measures for students to fulfil their course requirements and that are necessary for the proper and successful completion of studies (it is not a degree factory!);

- ▶ the faculty ensures that its staff comply with ethical principles in teaching and research activities.

In the above matters, faculty managers are working closely with the full support of the Academic Senate and with student councils.

As part of Charles University, the Faculty of Education is ready to actively engage in taking the necessary action to work with the Czech Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport for the launch of the Council of Europe's Pan-European Platform on Ethics, Transparency and Integrity in Education (ETINED). The faculty is also ready to assist in implementing strategies to support ethics, transparency and integrity in the education of children in Europe, specifically in the Czech Republic, and to educate future teachers in this spirit. Part of this platform's activities is discussion on the issue of ethical principles in education, including ethics in the work of teachers in education, plagiarism and fake certification. Since they profoundly affect the mission of the Faculty of Education (teacher training and the continuing professional learning and development of teachers), we shall closely follow and, where necessary, contribute to this debate, and disseminate and act upon the results of these discussions. Ethical principles in education will be exercised in relation to international co-operation emerging from activities in the Association for Teacher Education in Europe (ATEE), of which the faculty is an institutional member.

In conclusion, let me (once again) wish you a warm welcome and every success for the workings of the 7th Prague Forum.

Tomáš Zima, Rector of Charles University

As Rector of the biggest and oldest central European University, I warmly welcome the long-running activities of the Council of Europe to promote quality education at all levels of education.

Quality education is interconnected with equal opportunities for students, teachers and schools and thus I am very pleased that the Council of Europe considers these themes to be important, and battles to promote equal opportunities and set up a wide range of related measures.

Looking at the outcomes of the last ministerial meeting that took place in Helsinki in 2013, focusing on governance and quality education, I find it crucial that all ministers also agreed on the importance of information exchange through best practices on ethics and integrity in education and in this respect underlined the role of quality education.

Bearing in mind the globalisation of the European educational area, such things that threaten integrity in education cannot be resolved separately in each country. Thus I welcome the initiative of the Council of Europe and all member states to establish the Pan-European Platform on Ethics, Transparency and Integrity in Education.

From my perspective, I find such activities to be crucial not only because my university exists in the common European academic world, but also because we train the next generation of citizens and – what is more – future experts who will be educating the next generations of Europeans.